



COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA

HISTORIC LANDMARKS ADVISORY COMMISSION UNAPPROVED MINUTES

**Hearing of December 12, 2011
Meeting Time: 10:00 a.m.**

The regular hearing of the Santa Barbara County Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission was called to order by Chair John C. Woodward, at 10:00 a.m., in the County of Santa Barbara Planning Commission Hearing Room, Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:

JOHN C. WOODWARD, CHAIR
J'AMY BROWN
JAMES KYRIACO, JR.
BOB CUNNINGHAM
DEBORAH ACEVES
LANSING DUNCAN
EILEEN WYCKOFF
TOM HOM
HOWARD WITTAUSCH

AT LARGE
1ST DISTRICT
2ND DISTRICT
2ND DISTRICT
3RD DISTRICT
3RD DISTRICT
4TH DISTRICT
4TH DISTRICT
5TH DISTRICT

COMMISSIONERS ABSENT:

RANDY MELCOMBE

5TH DISTRICT

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT:

Dianne Black, Director of Development Services
Mary McMaster, Deputy County Counsel
Allen Bell, County Planner
Anita Hodoso-McFaul, HLAC Secretary

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: Approximately 5 people present.

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA

1. **ROLL CALL:** Commissioner Melcombe absent.
2. **MINUTES:** Hearing of November 14, 2011.
ACTION: Commissioner Duncan moved, seconded by Commissioner Wyckoff and carried by a vote of 9 to 0 (Melcombe absent) to approve the minutes of November 14, 2011 as corrected.
3. **PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.

4. STAFF UPDATE:

Dianne Black, County Director of Development Review, stated that she met with the subcommittee of Commissioners Brown and Wittausch to discuss ways of utilizing a subcommittee to screen projects that are in the Development Review process for historic issues and to determine whether a full HLAC review should be required. Future discussion on the process will be needed prior to bringing it to the commission for its consideration.

She also reported that an expansion budget is being worked on for potential budget augmentation requests for the Board of Supervisors to include establishment of a Local Government Program and other incentives. When complete, the budget request will be brought forward for future commission review aligning with the budget process at the BOS.

5. Consider and take action on the resolution to nominate the **Bryce Beach Cabana and Funicular** as a County Historic Landmark. The property is a 34 acre parcel and is shown as Assessor's Parcel Number: 063-160-034 located at 1553 Roble Drive, Santa Barbara, Second Supervisorial District.

Allen Bell, County Planner, briefed the Commission on the BOS decision which asked HLAC for an explanation of the reasoning and rationale behind reaching its conclusion to designate the Bryce Beach Cabana and Funicular as a Historic Landmark and not as a Place of Historic Merit.

Under the County's Historic Landmarks Ordinance, the nine criteria specified for Historic Landmark and Place of Historic Merit are the same. The difference is that a Landmark carries with it conditions and restrictions on the property, and requires Board of Supervisors approval, while a Place of Historic Merit does not impose restrictions and conditions on the property, and it does not need to be passed by the Board of Supervisors.

In this case Historic Landmark designation is sought by the owners to qualify the property for possible exemption under the Coastal Zoning Ordinance which could allow for repairs and renovation to preserve the structure. Designation as a Place of Historic Merit would not qualify the property for the exemption and would not provide a permit path for the repairs and renovation, leading to probable demolition and loss of an historic resource.

Presentation:

Steve Welton, Suzanne Elledge Planning and Development

Ken Minot, architect

Alex Cole, historian

Richard Monk, attorney

Jeff Rusack, owner

The HLAC resolution to designate the **Bryce Beach Cabana and Funicular** as a Landmark expired because the BOS did not adopt the resolution within 90 days as required by the ordinance. The owners have re-nominated it for designation as a Landmark, and not as a Place of Historic Merit. They plan to restore and preserve it from further deterioration, and Landmark designation is needed to obtain a possible permit path for the work.

The cabana and funicular cab were designed by Mary Craig, a significant and important designer in the history of Santa Barbara. The cabana is a very playful design and not typical of her other buildings in the 20s and 30s Spanish Colonial Revival style.

Public access is not a requirement of a Landmark. Vandalism is a constant problem. The concrete staircase, as requested by the owner, will not be included in the Landmark.

The cabana as a Landmark will be rehabilitated and preserved and will remain an important part of the history of Hope Ranch. One of the main reasons to landmark the cabana is so it can be structurally repaired. It is situated on the sand and structural repair would normally not be allowed, but landmarking could provide a path for permitting.

Public Comments:

Adrienne Schuele

HLAC Discussion:

- It is a unique architectural design that needs to be recognized.
- It is very fortunate that the owners are willing to restore such a historical place on the beach, and the commission is grateful for their commitment to its preservation.
- Plywood used for protection from vandalism negates the public benefit or view and the owners plan to remove it.
- The public loses something if the cabana and funicular were removed. A plaque for beach walkers without access might be educationally beneficial.
- The purpose of the Landmark designation is to preserve it for future generations, not to provide for public use.
- The owner is using current laws to qualify the structure for an exemption to restore and preserve it from demolition.
- It is a living monument, and vandalism will recede with time.
- Commissioner Kyriaco moved to designate the Bryce Beach Cabana and Funicular as a Place of Historic Merit. The motion did not receive a second. He would support the motion to landmark if it were only the funicular.

MOTION: Commissioner Wyckoff moved, seconded by Commissioner Hom and carried 7 to 1 (Kyriaco opposed, Melcombe absent, Cunningham recused) to adopt the resolution to designate the Bryce Beach Cabana and Funicular as a County Historic Landmark.

6. Consider and take action on the resolution to nominate the **Irene and Frances Rich Beach Cabana** as a County Historic Landmark. The property is a 4.20 acre parcel and is shown as Assessor's Parcel Number: 063-220-023, located at 4353 Marina Drive, Hope Ranch area, Second Supervisorial District.

Allen Bell, County Planner

- The cabana in its current state is considered a non-conforming structure. Structural alterations are prohibited, unless it is designated as a Historic Landmark. Caissons and related support structure were placed by a previous owner approximately six years ago to protect the support system under the deck. Due to potential public safety issues, the building access is restricted.
- An application for a Coastal Development permit is being processed, but it is presently incomplete. Coastal Zone issues are a separate process from HLAC criteria. There is a parallel process taking place in the permit process.
- The previous HLAC Landmark resolution has expired when it was not adopted by the Board of Supervisors.
- The owners have resubmitted a nomination for designation as a Landmark to qualify the property for possible exemption under the Coastal Zoning Ordinance which could allow for repairs and renovation to preserve the structure.
- HLAC is to use the nine criteria in the Landmarks Ordinance.

Presentation:

Julia and Lee Carr, owners

The current submission is a replication of the previous application to landmark with two exceptions: new, different, and additional reference materials were submitted for the public record; secondly, a compendium of public letters of support was submitted.

MOTION: Commissioner Brown moved, seconded by Chairman Woodward and carried 9 to 0 (Melcombe absent) to accept the additional materials entered into the record today.

Mrs. Carr read several public comment letters supporting the nomination into the record. A front page Santa Barbara News-Press article on Don MacGillivray was presented showing his wife, daughter and granddaughter pictured on the deck at the Rich Cabana. Shoreline Park was proposed to be re-named MacGillivray Park, but the family declined that offer.

- A Powerpoint presentation was given with historical information about Frances and Irene Rich and their cabana as well as about the other creators including W. Don MacGillivray, Harold Chase and Pearl Chase.
- Irene Rich was a famous actress in both silent and talkie movies as well as on stage and radio.
- She has two stars on the Hollywood Walk of Fame; one for films and one for radio.
- She was a recognized spokeswoman for many commercial products.
- Irene Rich's name is written under the portrait of Diego Rivera on the front of the current Mexican 500 Peso note dedicating his self-portrait to her.
- Frances Rich was also an actress and is a renowned sculptress with current museum exhibits in both Santa Barbara and Greece.
- The Hope Ranch location was visited by many celebrities and prominent locals.
- The cabana is the last remnant of Irene and Frances Rich's home in Santa Barbara.

Public Comment:

Shannon MacGillivray McGraw
Adrienne Schuele
Sue Adams
Judy Piper

HLAC Discussion:

- The cypress trees are part of the Landmark nomination and are shown on the survey map.
- The pathway from the cabana to the beach is the same routing with new stairs permitted in 2004.
- Minor alterations to the structure that have been made over the years are consistent with those typically allowed under the Landmarks Ordinance.
- The structure is best described as a cabana, not a guesthouse or studio.
- The survey map and legal description include the setting with its landscaping and pathway to the beach.
- The "Irene and Frances Rich Beach Cabana" will be the correct name of the Landmark.
- There are current professional reports that confirm the safety of the cabana and its setting. The deck was fully repaired and is an engineered pathway to the beach. The owners are applying for an as-built permit for the repairs.
- The owners have been a great resource and have made a tremendous effort to fully document the historic importance of the cabana. Seconded by another member who applauded them for their excellent and ongoing research – so much history revealed in such a small cabana.
- The cabana is the last remaining structure of their Hope Ranch home that was walked upon by Irene and Frances Rich.
- Historical accuracy for the preservation record is important. Distinguishing between what is historical and what has been changed should be documented. Photo documentation is sufficient to show what the structure is today.

- The commission thanked Mr. and Mrs. Carr for their willingness and ability to preserve the cabana as a historic resource. A lot of new information was presented today that greatly amplifies the historic importance of the Landmark.

MOTION: Commissioner Wyckoff moved, seconded by Commissioner Hom and carried by a vote of 9 to 0 (Melcombe absent) to adopt the resolution to designate the Irene and Frances Rich Beach Cabana as a County Historic Landmark with changes to the name to read "Irene and Frances Rich Beach Cabana" and to include the landscaping.

8. MONTHLY BUDGET REPORT AND DECISIONS: None.

9. DISTRICT REPORTS:

First District: Commissioner Brown: Historic Survey of Montecito progress will be reported at a future meeting.

Third District: Commissioner Duncan: An update on the Jonata Bridge plaque placement will be discussed at a future meeting. Santa Barbara County Public Works were able to remove one of the plaques from the sister bridge and gave it to the Buellton Historic Museum at Anderson's Pea Soup Restaurant.

10. NEXT MEETING of the Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission:

Date: January 9, 2012(Later cancelled)
Location: Santa Barbara County
Engineering Building, Room 17
Planning Commission Hearing Room
123 East Anapamu Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101

Respectfully submitted by,

Anita Hodosy-McFaul
Secretary, HLAC