

DISCUSSION ITEMS

6. The County Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission (HLAC) will discuss the potential nomination of the Cold Spring Canyon Bridge as a Santa Barbara County Historic Landmark. The property is located on State Route 154, Santa Barbara, Third Supervisorial District. (Continued from 4/9/07, 5/14/07, 6/11/07, 7/09/07, and 8/13/07)

ACTION: Commissioner Lowsley moved, seconded by Commissioner Schwartz and carried by a 7-0 vote (Adams and Stotts absent) to continue the item to the October 8, 2007 meeting.

HLAC COMMENTS:

- Requested that copies of Caltrans' historic reports on the Cold Springs Bridge be provided to Commissioners for their October meeting.
 - Commissioner Schwartz will be reviewing a KEYT program recently aired on the status of the project.
 - Commissioners await a staff update on Michelle Gibbs' request to be involved in the Caltrans' Project Development Team.
7. The County Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission (HLAC) will discuss the potential historic significance of the Arroyo Parida Bridge. The commission will be addressing the Caltrans proposal to replace the existing bridge. The property is located on State Route 192, Carpinteria, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 8/13/07)

ACTION: Commissioner Lowsley moved, seconded by Commissioner Mussel and carried by a 7-0 vote (Adams and Stotts absent) to continue the item to the October 8, 2007 meeting.

HLAC COMMENTS:

- HLAC requested that Michele Nellis attend the October hearing to speak to the item.

DECISION ITEM

8. The County's Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission (HLAC) will hold a public hearing and determine whether the pending Meadow Terrace project at the SB Botanic Garden is in compliance with Resolution 2003-059. Take appropriate action. The project involves installation of a three-tiered exhibit plaza area with three low level rock retaining walls defining the levels, and a surface in a flagstone rock treatment. The total project area is approximately 4,205 square feet, with planting beds along the edge of each retaining wall and sandstone flagstones making up the terraces. A total of 240 linear feet of retaining walls is proposed. The maximum exposed height of the retaining walls is 18 inches. The project involves less than 50 cubic yards of cut and/or fill. The project site is the former site of a large oak tree that was diseased and recently removed on the west side of the Meadow. The project is located in an area that is part of the historic landscape design concept of the Botanic Garden which is designated as part of County Historic Landmark #24 (Board of Supervisors Resolution 2003-059). The subject parcel is 12.83 acres in the REC zone and is shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-340-015, located at 1212 Mission Canyon Road, in the Mission Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 8/22/07)

ACTION: Commissioner Woodward moved, seconded by Commissioner Lowsley and carried by a 6-0-1 vote (Melcome abstained; Adams and Stotts absent) to make the finding that, pursuant to Section 2Bi of Board of Supervisors Resolution No. 2003-059 on County Historic Landmark No. 24, the SANTA BARBARA BOTANIC GARDEN, MISSION DAM AND AQUEDUCT, that (1) Resolution No. 24 includes the entirety of the subject parcel, therefore, the Santa Barbara Botanic Garden's Meadow Terrace project is located in an area that is considered part of the County Historic Landmark No. 24 and is not exempt under 2Bii and (2) that the proposed project may affect the historic resources protected under the Resolution and is therefore subject to review and approval by the HLAC.

ACTION: Commissioner Woodward moved, motion amended by Commissioner Lowenthal, amended motion seconded by Commissioner Schwartz and carried by a 6-0-1 vote (Melcombe abstained; Adams and Stotts absent) to find that the Meadow Terrace project substantially deviates from the historic landscape design concept, pursuant to Sections 2Bi and 2Bii of Board of Supervisors Resolution No. 2003-059 on County Historic Landmark No. 24, the SANTA BARBARA BOTANIC GARDEN, MISSION DAM AND AQUEDUCT, and is not permissible as proposed within the wording of Resolution 2003-059 due to the following:

1. The proposed project involves the conversion of natural landscaped area to paved landscaped area which would be a substantial deviation from the historic landscape design concept;
2. The overall size of the project (4,200 square feet) would result in a substantial deviation from the historic landscape design concept;
3. The proposed project involves an intensification of use of the area, and therefore, would be a substantial deviation from the historic use of the meadow;
4. The proposed project would adversely affect the Meadow, a defining feature of the Garden and would not meet the Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Cultural Landscapes; and
5. The impacts of the proposed project should be evaluated as part of the Botanic Garden's overall Vital Mission Plan project to avoid a piecemeal evaluation of impacts on historic resources.

ACTION: Commissioner Lowsley moved, seconded by Commissioner Schwartz and carried by a 7-0 vote (Adams and Stotts absent) to request that prior to submitting another formal application to Planning and Development, the Botanic Garden work with an ad-hoc subcommittee of the HLAC comprising Commissioners Woodward, Adams, and Schwartz to develop a new project that is either (1) modified from the current proposed project, but in the same location or (2) in an alternate location.

HLAC COMMENTS:

- Simply maintaining a "system of trails" in the Meadow does not adequately preserve the "historic landscape design concept" of the Meadow. The HLAC must consider the historic context of the Meadow landscaping. The Meadow has consisted of natural landscaping with natural trails over the past 50 years or more. Therefore, the "historic landscape design concept" is defined by the natural landscaping and natural trails, and the proposed urban hardscape (retaining walls and pavers) in the Meadow is a substantial deviation from this historic landscape design concept.
- The project may violate the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Cultural Landscapes.

- The sheer size of the project (4,200 SF) intrudes into the meadow and would constitute a substantial deviation from the historic landscape design concept.
- It is misleading to refer to the project as an exhibit project only, when the area would be used to hold events as well. The area is to be used for both plant exhibits and events, and should be identified as such.
- With the addition of hardscape, the proposed project would involve an intensification of use of the area for events, and therefore, would be a substantial deviation from the historic use of the area. The proposed “screen plantings” along the east and south portions of the terrace would serve to separate the event plaza from the Meadow, further underlining the project’s deviation from historic use.
- The installation of hardscape under the dripline of the existing oaks to the north and to the east of the proposed project could potentially damage the oaks and is of concern.
- The project as proposed, cannot be approved, and must be restudied. The project should be evaluated along with the Botanic Garden’s overall Vital Mission Plan project. Some members of the Commission recommend that the size of the project and/or materials be revised while some members of the Commission recommend that the new exhibit and event area be relocated to a more appropriate location, for example, between the library and the creek, near the greenhouse, where existing infrastructure already exists. Under the latter scenario, the flagstone flooring and walls that have already been installed should be removed and the area should be restored to natural trails and plantings including replanting an oak where the diseased oak was removed.
- The plans are inadequate to describe the project and need more detail and specificity, including a site plan showing the relationship of the project to the rest of the site.
- The plans show additional walls and pavers to the east of the main terrace area, beyond that which HLAC observed in the field, which would intrude further into the Meadow.
- The HLAC is very much interested in working with the Botanic Garden to support its mission and for future projects, encourages the Botanic Garden to come before the HLAC for conceptual review prior to submitting an application to Planning and Development.
- The HLAC seeks to improve its interactions with Planning and Development to ensure that it has accurate and adequate information to review projects early enough in the process to make informed decisions.

COMMISSION BUSINESS AND PROCEDURES

9. HLAC Monthly Budget Report and Decisions

- . Budget Report
- . Staff Support and Office Expense
- . Travel
- . Historic Surveys & Contracts:

Item not heard due to lack of time left in the meeting.

10. Election of Vice-Chair

The election of the new vice-chair was considered as follows:

ACTION: Commissioner Woodward moved, seconded by Commissioner Lowenthal and carried by a 7-0 vote (Adams and Stotts absent) to elect Deborah L. Schwartz as the vice-chair.

(