

**Villalobos, David**

---

**From:** Kellam de Forest [deforek@aol.com]  
**Sent:** Friday, December 11, 2015 2:08 PM  
**To:** Villalobos, David  
**Cc:** Brown, J'Amy  
**Subject:** Casa Dorinda

**Categories:** Purple Category

12-16-15  
MEETING DATE: 12-16-15

**David Villalobos**  
**Santa Barbara County Planning**

Dear Mr. Villalobos.

Would you kindly distribute this letter and attachment to the full MPC Board? I would like the Commission to consider as soon as possible regarding Casa Dorinda project.

Thank you,

Kellam de Forest

Chair Preservation Committee

RECEIVED

DEC 11 2015

S.B. COUNTY  
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT  
HEARING SUPPORT

Dear Chairman Brown and Commissioners,  
The Pearl Chase Society continues to request an EIR. Its mission is the preservation of significant historic structures. The original 1918 entrance is such a structure. The Society requests that the CUP include its preservation.

**Casa Dorinda Conditional Use Permit Update**

**Case No. 14RVP-00000-00005**

Considering the Mission of the Pearl Chase Society is to protect historic buildings and sites, the Board unanimously voted at its meeting of April 2 that the Society inform the appropriate decision making bodies that it does not support the current plans for the expansion of the Casa Dorinda retirement community as presented in the County Planning's Draft Mitigated Negative Declaration dated February 2, 2015.

The MNDR acknowledges that Casa Dorinda qualifies as an historic resource under CEQA and is eligible for listing as a County Landmark. Historical resources (buildings, structures, or archeological resources) are considered part of the environment and are subject to review under CEQA. The Society respectfully requests that a full Environmental Impact Report be prepared.

The Historic report is deficient in omitting that the site is an historic

cultural landscape. The designed cultural landscape surrounding a country house is as important as the house itself. Witness the Ludington estate Val Verde. The reports are also deficient in that there is no mention of the estate's landscape designer Peter Reidel, or any reference to reviewing the plans available in the Architectural Design Library at UCSB. The significant impact to a historic resource by the introduction of additional two story structures is not fully addressed. A proposed 5,000 square foot grill restaurant built on a lawn, part of the original landscape design, is deemed to have no sufficient impact. The open spaces next to the mansion are part of Carlton Winslow's historic design.

The 1918 entrance and exit bridges are, also, part of the original historic design. The historic exit bridge is to be demolished and a new two-lane modern bridge is to be constructed. The Montecito Community Plan states, "*Stone bridges are considered major architectural elements in the preservation of the rural character of the community and should be maintained.*"

The proposed expansion requires the removal of a half-acre of oak woodland, including the cutting down of 34 mature oak trees. The Montecito Land Use and Development Code states *Oak trees shall be protected to the maximum extent feasible. All land use activities, shall be carried out in a manner to avoid damage to native oak trees.... Oak woodlands shall be protected as habitat rather than as individual trees. Emphasis shall be placed on preservation and enhancement of oak woodlands*".

The Society acknowledges the necessity of Casa Dorinda to update its facility but asks such a updating be in keeping with the facility's historical design and landscape intent

Respectfully,

Barbara Lowenthal

President, Pearl Chase Society

**Gerber, Joyce**

---

**To:** Gerber, Joyce  
**Subject:** FW: Casa Dorinda

---

**From:** Kellam de Forest [<mailto:deforek@aol.com>]  
**Sent:** Monday, April 06, 2015 12:29 PM  
**To:** Gerber, Joyce  
**Cc:** Tuttle, Alex  
**Subject:** Casa Dorinda

**Joyce Gerber.**

**Below is the Pearl Chase Society's response to the County Planning' Draft Mitigated Negative Declaration. The Society apologizes that the response is submitted after the March 31 cut off date. Society Board approval is required for any Board action and approval had to await the monthly Board meeting. Alex Tuttle indicated late submissions would be accepted.**

**Respectfully,**

**Kellam de Forest**

**Casa Dorinda Master Plan Update  
Case No. 14RVP-00000-00005**

Considering the Mission of the Pearl Chase Society is to protect historic buildings and sites, the Board unanimously voted at its meeting of April 2 that the Society inform the appropriate decision making bodies that it does not support the current plans for the expansion of the Casa Dorinda retirement community as presented in the County Planning's Draft Mitigated Negative Declaration dated February 2, 2015.

The MNDR acknowledges that Casa Dorinda qualifies as an historic resource under CEQA and is eligible for listing as a County Landmark. Historical resources (buildings, structures, or archeological resources) are considered part of the environment and are subject to review under CEQA. The Society respectfully requests that a full Environmental Impact Report be prepared.

The Historic report is deficient in omitting that the site is an historic cultural landscape. The designed cultural landscape surrounding a country house is as important as the house itself. Witness the Ludington estate Val Verde. The reports are also deficient in that there is no mention of the estate's landscape designer Peter Reidel, or any reference to reviewing the plans available in the Architectural Design Library at UCSB. The significant impact to a historic resource by the introduction of additional two story structures is not fully addressed. A proposed 5,000 square foot grill restaurant built on a lawn, part of the

original landscape design, is deemed to have no sufficient impact. The open spaces next to the mansion are part of Carlton Winslow's historic design. The 1918 entrance and exit bridges are, also, part of the original historic design. The historic exit bridge is to be demolished and a new two-lane modern bridge is to be constructed. The Montecito Community Plan states, "*Stone bridges are considered major architectural elements in the preservation of the rural character of the community and should be maintained.*"

The proposed expansion requires the removal of a half-acre of oak woodland, including the cutting down of 34 mature oak trees. The Montecito Land Use and Development Code states *Oak trees shall be protected to the maximum extent feasible. All land use activities, shall be carried out in a manner to avoid damage to native oak trees.... Oak woodlands shall be protected as habitat rather than as individual trees. Emphasis shall be placed on preservation and enhancement of oak woodlands*".

The Society acknowledges the necessity of Casa Dorinda to update its facility but asks such a updating be in keeping with the facility's historical design and landscape intent

Respectfully,

Barbara Lowenthal

President, Pearl Chase Society

# Post/Hazeltine Associates

Architectural Historians  
2607 Orella Street  
Santa Barbara, CA 93105  
Phone: (805) 682-5751  
email: posthazeltine@cox.net

December 15, 2015

**Re: Response to a Letter from the Pearl Chase Society received by County Staff on December 11, 2015 regarding the Casa Dorinda Conditional Use Update, Montecito, California**

Dear Chairperson Brown and fellow Commissioners:

Post/Hazeltine Associates has reviewed the letter and has the following comments:

- With the exception of the forward by Kellam de Forest the letter appears to be the same document that was submitted by the Pearl Chase Society in April of this year.
- The letter states the bridge proposed for demolition was determined eligible for listing as a County Landmark when in fact, Alexandra Cole's report determined it was eligible as a Place of Historic Merit.
- The report prepared by Alexandra Cole (January of 2014 with an update in August of 2014) along with the Peer Review (May of 2015), Addendum Report (August of 2015) and the Letter Report for 352 Hot Springs Road (August 2015) prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates were all prepared to meet the standards for CEQA level review.
- The Post/Hazeltine Associates Addendum report prepared in August of 2015 included an evaluation of the designed landscape, which unfortunately, due to extensive changes carried out in 1970s, no longer retained its integrity of design or materials and was therefore, not a significant historic resource for the purposes of environmental review . The report included a history of the landscape and a biography of the landscape designer Peter Riedel. The Addendum Report prepared in 2015 did conclude that the rectangular terrace off the south side of the house as well as the vista extending towards the Pacific Ocean were contributors to the house's historic and architectural significance. The August 2015 Addendum Report also concluded that both bridges we as well as a portion of the stone-lined concrete channel, were significant resources for the purposes of environmental review. A double row of olive trees on the former Gould property were also found to be a significant resource for the purposes of environmental review.
- Because it no longer retains integrity of design or materials the landscape is not a significant historic cultural landscape for the purposes of environmental review.

Post Hazeltine Associates  
Casa Dorinda Conditional Use Permit Update  
Response to Pearl Chase Society Letter submitted December 11, 2015  
December 15, 2015

- The location of the proposed grill would not impact the current configuration of the south lawn or the setting of the house and would not impair the design integrity or setting of the rectangular terrace located off the south side of the house.
- In summary, we believe the issues raised in the April of 2015 letter from the Pearl Chase Society, which was resubmitted on December 11, 2015, have been adequately addressed in the Peer Review of May 2015, The Addendum Report of August 2015 and the Letter Report for 352 Hot Springs Road prepared in August of 2015.

Sincerely,

A black rectangular box containing a white handwritten signature that reads "Pamela Post".

Pamela Post, Ph.D.  
Senior Partner,  
Post/Hazeltine Associates