

From: [Nelson, Misty@Wildlife](mailto:Nelson.Misty@Wildlife)
To: [Harris, Julie](mailto:Harris,Julie)
Cc: [Klemann, Daniel](mailto:Klemann,Daniel); [Lackie, David](mailto:Lackie,David)
Subject: RE: CNDDDB data for ESH maps, letter to Board
Date: Thursday, June 28, 2018 11:23:46 AM

Hi Julie,

I apologize if somehow my intention with the letter has been misconstrued, and I thought I clarified much of this when I spoke with Dan Klemann a couple of weeks ago.

My letter was in no way meant to prescribe how you do your jobs or allocate resources – the letter was written at the behest of Brian Trautwein (I previously forwarded that email to Dan), who explained that he had spoken with county supervisors, and that such a letter would be used to support requests for allocation of additional resources to help update the maps. My intent was to give official permission to use the data should you wish to do so, not to request or require its use – that is well outside of my purview.

As far as the “highly” sensitive records, typically less than 5% of our total Element Occurrences fall in the “suppressed data” category – I would be happy to send you a list of those elements if you’d like. From a quick look at our data in your general area, though, the only suppressed record is for a prairie falcon nest observed in 1979 that hasn’t been seen since – and I don’t know if it’s even in your project area. So, this might be a moot concern.

Again, I apologize if my intent has been misinterpreted or misconstrued. Please let me know if you have any additional questions.

Thank you,
Misty

Misty D. Nelson

Lead Scientist
California Natural Diversity Database
Biogeographic Data Branch
California Department of Fish and Wildlife
Phone: (916) 323-8970

Physical Address:

1700 9th Street, 4th Floor
Sacramento, CA 95811

Mailing Address:

P.O. Box 944209
Sacramento, CA 94244-2090

From: Harris, Julie <Jharris@co.santa-barbara.ca.us>
Sent: Thursday, June 28, 2018 10:47 AM

To: Nelson, Misty@Wildlife <Misty.Nelson@wildlife.ca.gov>

Cc: Klemann, Daniel <dklemann@co.santa-barbara.ca.us>; Lackie, David <Dlackie@co.santa-barbara.ca.us>

Subject: RE: CNDDDB data for ESH maps, letter to Board

Good Morning Misty:

Thank you for sending me a copy of the CNDDDB letter, dated June 15, 2018.

Notwithstanding this letter, in our last phone conversation, before the May 2nd Planning Commission hearing on the EGVCP ESH/RC Overlays Map Update, we agreed that the County Planning and Development (P&D) Department could share with the public certain CNDDDB data map data (i.e., shape files depicting approximate spatial locations without species data) without compromising the CNDDDB license agreement. However, you also stated that you must review any proposed additions to any map before P&D makes it available to the public. Contrary to your letter, which suggests spatial features for all species could be shared, you were very clear in our phone conversation that spatial features for some species are too sensitive to share.

We agreed on the adequacy of P&D's approach to sharing spatial features by making it available on P&D's general biological resources maps as P&D moves forward with plans to make these maps available on the P&D website. By sharing this information on P&D's general resources maps, we can update the maps whenever the CNDDDB provides updated information, provided the CNDDDB grants P&D permission to share the new information with the public. However, we did not agree and you did not suggest or require that P&D add it to the ESH Overlay, which is a static document that can only be updated through a planning and hearing process.

Although P&D does not currently share the CNDDDB, P&D staff regularly uses it in our planning efforts, including during the review of permit applications for development to determine whether site specific biological studies would be required to determine presence/absence of rare species and potential impacts from proposed development. Thank you for considering this clarification of the approach we discussed and to which we agreed.

Sincerely,

Julie L. Harris, Senior Planner
Long Range Planning Division
Planning & Development Department
County of Santa Barbara
(805) 568-3543

From: Nelson, Misty@Wildlife <Misty.Nelson@wildlife.ca.gov>

Sent: Friday, June 15, 2018 12:36 PM

To: Wolf, Janet <jwolf@countyofsb.org>

Cc: Brian Trautwein <btrautwein@environmentaldefensecenter.org>; Harris, Julie

<Jharris@co.santa-barbara.ca.us>

Subject: CNDDDB data for ESH maps, letter to Board

Good afternoon Ms. Wolf,

I have recently been in communication with Brian Trautwein from EDC regarding maps and data being utilized as part of Santa Barbara County's Eastern Goleta Valley Community Plan. I have also spoken to Julie Harris with the County Planning Department. Specifically, there are concerns that data obtained from the California Natural Diversity Database (CNDDDB) is being excluded from maps of Environmentally Sensitive Habitats (ESH), because County staff are adhering to the terms set forth in the CNDDDB License Agreement. I believe in this instance that conservation will be better served by incorporating CNDDDB data into the ESH maps, and I have attached a letter to the Board of Supervisors granting permission to incorporate those data into ESH maps.

Please let me know if you have any questions, or would like any additional information at this time.

Thanks so much for your assistance.

Warm regards,
Misty

Misty D. Nelson

Lead Scientist
California Natural Diversity Database
Biogeographic Data Branch
California Department of Fish and Wildlife
Phone: (916) 323-8970

Physical Address:

1700 9th Street, 4th Floor
Sacramento, CA 95811

Mailing Address:

P.O. Box 944209
Sacramento, CA 94244-2090



State of California – Natural Resources Agency
DEPARTMENT OF FISH AND WILDLIFE
Director's Office
P.O. Box 944209
Sacramento, CA 94244-2090
www.wildlife.ca.gov

EDMUND G. BROWN JR., Governor
CHARLTON H. BONHAM, Director



June 15, 2018

Supervisor Das Williams, Chair
Santa Barbara County Board of Supervisors
105 East Anapamu Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101

Dear Mr. Williams:

**EASTERN GOLETA VALLEY COMMUNITY PLAN ESH MAP UPDATE PROJECT -
MAPPING OF RARE SPECIES' HABITATS – JULY 3, 2018 HEARING**

I have recently been in communication with individuals from Santa Barbara County who have expressed concerns that insufficient information is being conveyed in recent maps generated by County planning staff as part of the Eastern Goleta Valley Community Plan. Specifically, the issue relates to whether rare species information from the California Natural Diversity Database (CNDDDB) should be included in maps of Environmentally Sensitive Habitats, or ESHs. While it is true that the CNDDDB License Agreement and Data Use Guidelines specify the scales at which CNDDDB data may be displayed for public viewing, there are special circumstances that may warrant exemptions to this agreement. As Lead Scientist for CNDDDB, I am hereby granting permission for the County of Santa Barbara to incorporate CNDDDB data into their ESH maps, under the following conditions:

1. Only the spatial features should be incorporated into the maps; information and details about which species the map features represent should not be made available or displayed on public maps. This includes the color display of features, which should all be made uniform.
2. The spatial feature symbology should be retained, and maps should expressly disclose what that symbology represents. Different shapes represent different degrees of spatial uncertainty associated with source records (e.g. larger circles represent greater uncertainty, not necessarily a larger area of occurrence), and it is essential to understand the symbology in order to avoid misinterpretation of the data. Information on CNDDDB symbology can be found on the CNDDDB website (<https://www.wildlife.ca.gov/Data/CNDDDB>), or made available on request.
3. All remaining terms of the CNDDDB License Agreement shall be adhered to, and maps that include CNDDDB data shall cite the database, including the version used and date accessed.

Fundamentally, the goal of CNDDDB is to provide the best possible data on the locations of rare species in California, and to encourage the use of those data when undertaking projects that may impact special status species. I believe that incorporating these data

Misty Nelson, Lead Scientist
California Natural Diversity Database
June 15, 2018
Page 2

into planning efforts will help to facilitate better conservation practices, and ultimately serve to protect California's unique natural resources.

Thank you for your consideration, and please don't hesitate to contact me with any questions or concerns.

Respectfully yours,



Misty D. Nelson
Lead Scientist, California Natural Diversity Database
Biogeographic Data Branch
California Department of Fish & Wildlife

Physical Address:

1700 9th Street, 4th Floor
Sacramento, CA 95811

Mailing Address:

P.O. Box 944209
Sacramento, CA 94244

Email: Misty.Nelson@wildlife.ca.gov

Phone: (916) 323-8970