



COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA

HISTORIC LANDMARKS ADVISORY COMMISSION APPROVED MINUTES

Special Hearing of November 15, 2007
Meeting Time of 1:00 p.m.

The special hearing of the Santa Barbara County Historic Landmarks Commission was called to order by Chair Eileen Wyckoff, at 1:00 p.m., in the Santa Barbara Engineering Building, Planning Commission Hearing Room, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:

BARBARA LOWENTHAL; SUE ADAMS; JOHN WOODWARD, AT LARGE MEMBER
DEBORAH L. SCHWARTZ, VICE-CHAIR
EILEEN WYCKOFF, CHAIR

COMMISSIONERS ABSENT:

RANDY MELCOMBE
JAMES LOWSLEY
BARRY STOTTS
AUDREY MUSSEL

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT:

David Villalobos, HLAC Secretary
Michelle Gibbs, HLAC Planner
Mary Pat Barry, Deputy County Counsel
Anne Almy, Supervising Planner, Development Review South
Alex Tuttle, Planner, Development Review South

REPORTERS: None in attendance.

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: Approximately 50

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA

1. **ROLL CALL:** Commissioners Melcombe, Lowsley, Stotts, and Mussel absent.
2. **PUBLIC COMMENT:** Marc McGinnes (letter): Proposes alternative "human barriers" plan to respond more effectively than physical barriers to problems of suicidal behavior on the Cold Spring Bridge.

DECISION ITEM:

3. **Background:** On September 10, 2007, the County's Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission (HLAC) considered and denied consent to the Santa Barbara Botanic Garden's (the Garden) Meadow Terrace project and requested that the Garden work with an ad hoc subcommittee of HLAC to develop a new modified proposed project. The Garden appealed HLAC's decision to the Board of Supervisors; the appeal is set for hearing on November 20, 2007.

At HLAC's October 8, 2007 hearing, the HLAC Chair appointed an HLAC ad hoc subcommittee to meet with the Garden to address issues raised by the Garden's appeal. In the process of addressing those issues, the Garden has presented the ad hoc subcommittee with a new modified Meadow Terrace proposed project.

Special Meeting: HLAC will hold a public hearing at which HLAC's ad hoc subcommittee will report its activities to the full Commission; and the Garden will present the new modified Meadow Terrace project for consideration and decision by HLAC. If the new modified Meadow Terrace project requires and receives HLAC consent as provided in County Resolution 2003-059, the Garden will withdraw its appeal of HLAC's September 10, 2007 decision. The new modified Meadow Terrace project site is the former site of a large oak tree that was diseased and recently removed on the west side of the Meadow. The project is located in an area that is part of the historic landscape design concept of the Botanic Garden, which is designated as part of County Historic Landmark No. 24 (Board of Supervisors Resolution 2003-059). The subject parcel is 12.83 acres in the REC zone and is shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-340-015, located at 1212 Mission Canyon Road, in the Mission Canyon area, First Supervisorial District.

ACTION: Commissioner Woodward moved, seconded by Commissioner Schwartz and carried by a 5-0 vote (Melcombe, Lowsley, Stotts, and Mussell absent) to continue the item to the HLAC hearing of December 10, 2007.

HLAC COMMENTS:

- The HLAC ad-hoc subcommittee formed to address the appeal of the commission's decision on the Meadow Terrace project met with the Botanic Garden in order to seek common ground, as the HLAC would like to establish a good, long term relationship with the applicant. The two sides agree that a collaborative effort to find a solution is in the best interest of all involved.
- The meetings between the ad-hoc subcommittee and the applicant were productive. Two alternative proposals have been formed. The Botanic Garden feels that the revised project removes hardscaping to the maximum extent possible and responds to the concerns of the HLAC. If HLAC endorses the revised project, the Botanic Garden will drop the appeal and proceed with the new project. If not, the applicant will pursue the appeal.
- The commission is concerned with the lack of details in the revised plan and requests that the following additional information be provided to them prior to the December 10, 2007 hearing: a) Elevations of existing walls and elevations of heights of stone walls that move into the side of the Meadow, b) Schematic (site plan renderings) showing the project in relation with meadow itself and entire landmarked parcel, c) Visual representation of the view from the original entry steps into the garden across the meadow to the terrace, d) Full written project description, e) Sections through center of three proposed walls to show differences in topography, and f) historic perspective (written description of the meadow area and the area where the proposed project is to be placed) from Botanic Garden's archives.

4. Next Meeting of the Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission

Date: December 10, 2007
Location: Administration/Engineering Building Complex
105/123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara

In the event HLAC holds a special meeting before the December 10, 2007 meeting, notice of such special meeting will be provided pursuant to California Government Code Section 54956.

3. **PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.

DECISION ITEMS

4. On September 10, 2007, the County's Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission (HLAC) considered and denied consent to the Santa Barbara Botanic Garden's (the Garden) Meadow Terrace project and requested that the Garden work with an ad hoc subcommittee of HLAC to develop a new modified proposed project. The Garden appealed HLAC's decision to the Board of Supervisors; the appeal is set for hearing on January 8, 2008.

At HLAC's October 8, 2007 hearing, the HLAC Chair appointed an HLAC ad hoc subcommittee to meet with the Garden to address issues raised by the Garden's appeal. In the process of addressing those issues, the Garden has presented the ad hoc subcommittee with a new modified Meadow Terrace proposed project.

At a Special Meeting on November 15, 2007 HLAC's ad hoc subcommittee reported its activities to the full Commission and the Garden presented a new modified Meadow Terrace project for consideration and decision by HLAC. HLAC received public comment and continued its discussion and decision-making to its December 10, 2007 agenda.

At the December 10, 2007 meeting, the Garden will present additional information requested by HLAC. If the new modified Meadow Terrace project requires and receives HLAC consent as provided in County Resolution 2003-059, the Garden will withdraw its appeal of HLAC's September 10, 2007 decision. The new modified Meadow Terrace project site is the former site of a large oak tree that was diseased and recently removed on the west side of the Meadow. The project is located in an area that is part of the historic landscape design concept of the Botanic Garden, which is designated as part of County Historic Landmark No. 24 (Board of Supervisors Resolution 2003-059). The subject parcel is 12.83 acres in the REC zone and is shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-340-015, located at 1212 Mission Canyon Road, in the Mission Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/15/07)

ACTION: Commissioner Woodward moved, seconded by Commissioner Adams and carried by a 5-0-4 vote (Melcombe, Lowsley, Mussell, and Shepherd abstained; Stotts absent) to formally adjourn the hearing of November 15, 2007.

ACTION: Commissioner Woodward moved, seconded by Commissioner Lowsley and carried by a 5-4 vote (Lowenthal, Schwartz, Adams, Musell no; Stotts absent) to disapprove the modified project and through incorporation by reference of the findings made at its September 10, 2007 meeting concerning a previous version of the terrace project, the following:

- i. The proposed project involves the conversion of natural landscaped area to paved landscape area which would be a substantial deviation from the historic landscape design concept;
- ii. The overall size of the project (4,200 square feet) would result in a substantial deviation from the historic landscape design concept;
- iii. The proposed project involved an intensification of use of the area, and therefore, would be a substantial deviation from the historic use of the meadow;
- iv. The proposed project would adversely affect the Meadow, a defining feature of the Garden and would not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Cultural Landscape; and
- v. The impact of the proposed project should be evaluated as part of the Botanic Garden's overall Vital Mission Plan project to avoid piecemeal evaluation of impacts on historic resources.

HLAC COMMENTS:

- The Garden is to be congratulated for attempting interesting improvements to the project. Commissioner Lowsley believes, however, that the project is still too large, encroaches into the historic landscape design, and should be rolled into the Vital Mission Plan EIR.
 - Commissioner Shepherd voiced concern that the terrace is being built under the dripline of an oak tree on the site, and does not believe the proposed terrace conforms to the intent of the landmark.
 - Commissioner Woodward is disappointed that the revised project seems to represent very little change from the original project. He also clarified that nobody has said that the meadow terrace area should not be used for the display of native plants or that it should cease being a site of special events. He echoed the concerns of Commissioner Shepherd regarding the proposed paved area under the dripline of the oak tree. It represents a change from natural landscape to paved landscape and is an invasion into the meadow. He also believes that there is a strong argument that the intensification of use is a deviation from the historic use of the site.
 - Commissioner Schwartz believes it is important to balance the needs of all the voices HLAC has heard from, and would like to apply practical as well as ideal considerations. She asks how the commission can support the needs of the Garden and find common ground.
 - Commissioner Adams stated that the Garden has come a long way to illustrate the unique beauty of this area and that the HLAC is thankful for the limitless passion of the public. She believes that the commission has not shown a tendency to freeze frame the meadow. However, the project is unnatural, permanent. It deviates from the historic landscape meadow design. Although Planning and Development was correct in rescinding the substantial conformity determination, the Garden started the process in good faith. None of the ad-hoc subcommittee members are satisfied that all of their needs have been met, but it is important to reach a balance. She can support much of this compromise and hopes the revised project will bring HLAC a better working relationship with the Garden.
 - Commissioner Lowenthal would like to continue to work with the Garden on this project, a sentiment seconded by Commissioner Schwartz. Commissioner Woodward believes that there have been three months to reach a compromise and nothing precludes further discussion if the revised project is disapproved.
5. The County Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission (HLAC) will discuss and approve or disapprove the proposal to hire a professional photographer to photo document the San Jose Winery in Goleta, Santa Barbara County Historic Landmark #25. (Continued from 5/14/07, 6/11/07, 7/09/07, 8/13/07, 9/10/07, and 10/08/07)

ACTION: Commissioner Wyckoff moved, seconded by Commissioner Schwartz and carried by a 9-0 vote (Stotts absent) to continue the item to the HLAC hearing of January 14, 2008.

6. The County Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission (HLAC) will consider and approve or disapprove a revised Resolution to designate Rancho La Purisima/Pleasant Valley School House as a Santa Barbara County Place of Historic Merit, said revised Resolution being a corrected version of the original Resolution approved by HLAC on September 10, 2007, and as a result of the correction having been made subsequent to the September 10, 2007 approval, requiring consideration and approval or disapproval of the revised Resolution. The property involves AP No. 099-640-006, located at 2085 Jonata Park Road, Buellton, Third Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/14/07, 6/11/07, 7/09/07, and 9/10/07)