

Barker, Russ

From: Lanny Ebenstein <lannyebenstein@aol.com>
Sent: Monday, February 16, 2015 3:57 PM
To: sbcob
Subject: Mission Canyon Multimodal Plan
Attachments: Nomination.pdf

Dear Members of the Board of Supervisors:

This email is to encourage you to oppose the Mission Canyon Multimodal Plan at your meeting Tuesday. This plan would have many negative attributes, including:

Loss of Historic Resources

Approximately 50 feet of historic walls dating from the 1800s are proposed for demolition and moving, including stone walls on East Los Olivos Street, part of the "aqueduct wall" on the old Hazard estate, and part of the "stegosaurus" wall on Mission Canyon Road. These walls were recently nominated for historic landmark status, and the nominators have been informed that a historic report previously commissioned has determined these walls are landmark eligible, and accordingly must be treated as historic landmarks. In addition, the walls are located in the Mission Canyon Scenic Corridor, which was specifically established to protect historic and other resources. Mission Historical Park is a California Historical Landmark. Moreover, the proposed plan is in a National Historic Landmarks District.

Though discussion of the loss of historic resources to this point has focused on the demolition and moving of nineteenth century stone walls, negative historical impacts would also include the effect on the historic stone bridge. The stone bridge also dates to the 1800s and is among the specifically protected historic resources in the existing city landmark designation. It is also in the California Historic Resources Inventory. To locate a 140-foot prefabricated steel bridge over Mission Creek immediately adjacent to the historic stone bridge, and the metal framework for which would appear several feet above the existing bridge, would be inconsistent with existing landmark protections of the bridge. Merely on the basis of the loss of historic resources with already very extensive local, state, and federal protection, this project is very unlikely ever to occur.

Inconsistency with Mission Canyon Community Plan

The recently adopted Mission Canyon Community Plan contains many protections for historic, visual, and natural resources, and the multimodal plan would be inconsistent with many of them. As Randy Reetz, who served on the Mission Canyon Planning Advisory Committee that drafted the Mission Canyon Community Plan, said of the "high points" of the plan as it was being adopted in April 2014: "Establishing the Mission Canyon Scenic Corridor. I'm not aware of any other community plan that sets aside, as a specially protected area, one distinctive part of the community. This single stretch of roadway was the cradle of our canyon's turn-of-the-century literary and artistic community; it housed our civic leaders, it preserved our natural woodland setting, and Mission Creek stone bridge and the stone walls bordering the roadway are local treasures" (Mission Canyon Association newsletter [Spring 2014], p. 2).

In the Mission Canyon Community Plan itself in the section on Historic Setting: "Mission Canyon has an array of ... historical resources including sandstone walls, bridges, and numerous historical and architecturally significant homes" (p. 115). In the section, History and Archaeology Goal, Policies, Development Standards, and Actions, the first "GOAL HA-MC-1" is: "Preserve and protect historically significant landscapes, County Places of Historic Merit, County Historic Landmarks, and other cultural, archaeological, and historical resources in Mission Canyon" (p. 116). Policy HA-MC-2 is: "Historical resources shall be protected and preserved to the maximum extent feasible" (p. 116).

In the part on the "Visual and Aesthetic Resources" in the adopted Mission Canyon Community Plan, the Setting of Mission Canyon is presented as follows: "Mission Canyon Road is heavily traveled and represents a 'gateway entrance' into the Plan Area. The road is ... considered a scenic corridor that physically and visually differentiates Mission Canyon from the City of Santa Barbara. Development in this scenic corridor deserves special consideration to ensure it does not detract from the historical character, natural surroundings, and aesthetics of the neighborhood. Protection of visual resources in this area merits a heightened level of design review" (p. 118). The Mission Canyon Scenic Corridor was

specifically established "to recognize and preserve the special character, history, and scenic appeal of the gateway entrance to Mission Canyon" (p. 120).

Radical Transformation of the Gateway Entrance to Mission Canyon

There can be little question that the proposed Mission Canyon Multimodal Plan would radically transform the protected gateway entrance to Mission Canyon. In addition to the demolition and relocation of landmark eligible stone walls and the placement of a 140-foot prefabricated steel bridge adjacent to the existing protected stone bridge, a new sidewalk would be placed on the western side of Mission Canyon Road in front of and puncturing the historic stegosaurus wall, and Mission Canyon Road would be widened and straightened from the stone bridge until Puesta del Sol by 14 feet to the east.

In particular, eastern side pedestrian access would be lost. As a result of the realignment of Los Olivos Street to the east in order to make the pedestrian sidewalk feasible on the west, Los Olivos would be widened to the east at the existing Mountain Drive-Los Olivos intersection, thereby eliminating the existing eastern pedestrian access at this intersection. For this reason, Multimodal Plan advocates have recommended a second pedestrian bridge across Mission Creek to the east of the existing stone bridge and a tunnel underneath Alameda Padre Serra (see Mission Heritage Trails Association website, "Concept Plans and Ideas"; "The Arch," "East Pedestrian Bridge," and "East Corridor Pedestrian Passage at Reservoir/Grist Mill" drawings).

Safety Concerns

Mission Canyon Road and Los Olivos would become less safe for pedestrians, bicyclists, and motorists. By closing the Mountain Drive intersection eastern side pedestrian access, pedestrians—including school children—would cross Los Olivos Street to the proposed western pedestrian access at the most dangerous spot. Similarly, access would be precluded on the eastern side between Rocky Nook Park and Mission Historical Park. The historic and neighborhood-defining eastern side pedestrian access would be lost. By straightening and widening Mission Canyon Road between the Mission Bridge and Puesta del Sol, traffic speed would increase and Mission Canyon Road would become less safe for bicyclists, pedestrians, and motorists.

Thank you for your consideration. The Mission Canyon Multimodal Plan would be a bad proposal to adopt, and I hope you will reject it. A copy of the Historic Landmark application recently submitted to the city is attached.

Yours sincerely,
Lanny Ebenstein

NOMINATION APPLICATION - CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK

EXPANSION OF CITY COUNCIL RESOLUTION NO. 98-008 DESIGNATING MISSION HISTORICAL PARK A CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK TO INCLUDE STONE WALLS IN AND ADJACENT TO MISSION HISTORICAL PARK AND MISSION BRIDGE AND PROTECT THEM FROM DEMOLITION, REMOVAL, OR RELOCATION

1. The purpose of this Nomination Application is to expand City Council Resolution No. 90-008 designating Mission Historical Park a City Historic Landmark to include stone walls in and adjacent to Mission Historical Park and Mission Bridge and protect them from demolition, removal, or relocation.
2. The stone walls that are included in this Nomination Application are all stone walls extending from the Old Mission Santa Barbara fronting East Los Olivos Street to and adjacent to Mission Bridge including the “Stegosaurus” stone wall extending from Mission Bridge to and in front of the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History on Puesta Del Sol Road, including stone walls in front of 505 East Los Olivos Street and 609 Mission Canyon Road; and including the stone wall that intersects these walls on the southern side of Mission Creek and southwest corner of Mission Bridge.
3. These stone walls are extremely important and sensitive historic resources. As recorded in the minutes of the August 27, 2014, meeting of the Santa Barbara Historic Landmarks Commission, comments of the Commission with respect to these walls are presented as follows: “The Commission considers the two walls extremely important and they are sensitive historic resources.”
4. The historic resources of Mission Historical Park and the Old Mission Santa Barbara in totality constitute the leading and most important historic resource in the City of Santa Barbara and are among the most important historic resources in California and the United States. Existing historic designations adjacent to and in the immediate vicinity of the proposed new City Historic Landmark include:

Old Mission Santa Barbara	National Historic Landmark District National Historic Landmark National Register of Historic Places California Historical Landmark City of Santa Barbara Historic Landmark
Mission Historical Park	National Register of Historic Places California Historical Landmark City of Santa Barbara Historic Landmark
Mission Bridge	California Historic Resources Inventory American Engineering Record Inventory City of Santa Barbara Historic Landmark
Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History	City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit

5. The existing Resolution No. 98-008 designating Mission Historical Park a City Historic Landmark specifically includes in its title “THE 1891 STONE BRIDGE OVER MISSION CREEK AT MISSION CANYON ROAD” as a protected resource. In the historic and cultural significance of facts attached to and incorporated into the Resolution, the following historical background is included:

The 10.24 acres of land that is now Mission Historical Park, excluding the lower reservoir parcel, was acquired by the City in 1928 and 1948.... For many years Miss Pearl Chase, with other citizens and officials, supported efforts to acquire, protect, and improve Mission Park, or Mission Plaza, and its historic structures. In March, 1957, the park’s name was changed to Mission Historical Park, largely at Miss Chase’s instigation....

1891 and 1910 Resources

The Stone Bridge

The single-arch stone masonry bridge over Mission Creek, joining East Los Olivos Street with Mission Canyon Road, was built in 1891 by Dover and Woods, stonemasons and contractors.... In December, 1908, Miss Caroline Hazard asked the City Council to allow her to affix a tablet to the bridge which would list her father Rowland Hazard’s connection with it. She stated that he had drawn the

specifications and plans for the bridge, had superintended its construction, and had paid \$1,500 towards the cost. The County had paid \$980 of the cost ... The Hazards owned the nearby 'Mission Hill' estate.

The span is 23.0 feet high, 27.7 feet in length, and 34 feet wide. The length along the top, from boundary post to boundary post, is approximately 140 feet ...

6. The July 24, 1981, Staff Report accompanying designation of the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History as a City Structure of Merit provides this history:

Since the Museum of Natural History was not annexed to the City of Santa Barbara until 1968, its major buildings were constructed under the jurisdiction of the County of Santa Barbara....

Rowland Gibson Hazard, an egg collector and naturalist, became a member of the Museum board in 1917, but he died in January, 1918. His sister, Caroline Hazard, replaced him on the board....

Miss Hazard gave a 1.66 acre piece of land bordering Mission Creek, and Mrs. Hazard donated construction funds. The land had been part of the Hazard Estate, which extended from the northerly border of the Old Mission property, across Mission Creek to Puesta del Sol....

Joseph Dover, renowned local stonemason, built the jagged-topped stone wall fronting [the Museum] ... Rowland Hazard, father of Rowland Gibson and Caroline Hazard, commissioned the wall circa 1891 as part of the wall system bordering his property.

In the Planning Staff's original "Recommendation" to the City Historic Landmarks Commission of the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History as a City Landmark (rather than a Structure of Merit), included in the July 24, 1981, Staff Report, the Planning Staff recommended "the 1891-92 stone wall fronting Puesta del Sol Road" be included in the landmark designation. Caroline Hazard was a former president of Wellesly College.

7. The section of Mission Canyon Road included in the proposed new City Historic Landmark is designated as part of the Mission Canyon Scenic Corridor under the Mission Canyon Community Plan and is given special status and protection to preserve historic stone walls, Mission Bridge, and other historical and archeological resources. Comments of the Santa Barbara County Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission on the area include:

* Concerns that ... widening and straightening of the [Mission Canyon] corridor will allow and encourage unsafe traffic speed....

* Cluster of trees and bridge are historic and necessary obstructions and are a gateway from the City of Santa Barbara and the County of Santa Barbara....

* The stegosaurus wall which some historians have determined to be eligible for landmark status should not be manipulated or shortened. [Santa Barbara County HLAC Minutes, September 8, 2014]

8. A National Historic Landmark is defined as follows: “Nationally significant historic places are designated by the Secretary of the Interior because they possess exceptional value or quality in illustrating or interpreting the heritage of the United States” (National Park Service 2014). The National Register of Historic Places states: “The National Register of Historic Places is the official list of the Nation’s historic places worthy of preservation” (NRHP website).

9. The area of Mission Creek immediately adjacent to and surrounded by the proposed City Historic Landmark is an extremely valuable and sensitive archaeological site and riparian habitat. The Chumash village *Xana’yan* was located in the vicinity. During the decades following the founding of the Presidio in 1782 and the Mission in 1786, Mission Historical Park and adjacent areas were a population center for the Chumash. The part of Mission Creek adjacent to the proposed new City Historic Landmark is a vital steelhead trout habitat.

10. The proposed new City Historic Landmark meets the following criteria listed in Section 22.22.040 of the Municipal Code for designation as a City Historic Landmark:

- a) The proposed landmark’s character, interest, or value is a significant part of the heritage of the City, the State, or the Nation;
- b) The proposed landmark’s location is the site of a significant historic event;
- c) The proposed landmark is identified with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the culture and development of the City, the State, or the Nation;
- d) The proposed landmark exemplifies a particular architectural style or way of life important to the City, the State, or the Nation;
- e) The proposed landmark exemplifies the best remaining architectural type in a neighborhood;

f) The proposed landmark is identified as the creation, design, or work of a person or persons whose effort has significantly influenced the heritage of the City, the State, or the Nation;

g) The proposed landmark embodies elements demonstrating outstanding attention to architectural design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship;

h) The proposed landmark is vitally and integrally related to other landmarks, including the Santa Barbara Mission and Mission Bridge;

i) The proposed landmark is a unique location and possesses singular physical characteristics representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood;

j) The proposed landmark has the potential of yielding significant information of archeological interest;

k) The proposed landmark contributes to the preservation of natural resources.

11. Additional information and nominators may be submitted during the application process.

Respectfully submitted,

Paulina Conn (date)

Lanny Ebenstein (date)

Francesca Galt (date)

Randy Reetz (date)

Kevin Rivera (date)

Neal Graffy (date)